How Valuable are Improvements in Residential Electricity Supply? Evidence from Nepal

Anna Alberini (AREC, University of Maryland) Jevgenijs Steinbuks (INFCE, World Bank) Govinda Timilsina (DECRG, World Bank)

> Prepared for ESMAP Virtual BBL April 25, 2023





How Valuable are Improvements in Residential Electricity Supply? Evidence from Nepal

©2020 The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank

1818 H Street NW

Washington DC 20433

Telephone: 202-473-1000

Internet: www.worldbank.org

All rights reserved

This study is a product of the staff of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this study do not necessarily reflect the views of the Executive Directors of The World Bank or the governments they represent.

The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this work. The boundaries, colors, denominations and other information shown on any map in this work do not imply any judgment on the part of the World Bank concerning the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

Rights and Permissions

The material in this study is copyrighted. Copying and/or transmitting portions or all of this work without permission may be a violation of applicable law. The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank encourages dissemination of its work and will normally grant permission to reproduce portions of the work promptly.

For permission to photocopy or reprint any part of this work, please send a request with complete information to the Copyright Clearance Centre Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA; telephone: 978-750-8400; fax: 202-522-2422; e-mail: pubrights@worldbank.org.

Presentation Outline

- 1. Research Questions (and Answers)
- 2. Nepal Load-Shedding Crisis
- 3. Research Design and Data
- 4. Key Results

Presentation Outline

- 1. Research Questions (and Answers)
- 2. Nepal Load-Shedding Crisis
- 3. Research Design and Data
- 4. Key Results

Research Questions and Answers

Q: How much are Nepali households willing to pay for reliable power supply?

A1: <u>Quite a bit</u>. On average 123.32 NR (\$1.11) per month, or 65 percent of the actual average monthly bill.

A2: <u>Not so much</u>. 26 percent of the households aren't willing to pay anything (if we believe them). Lots of heterogeneity [TBC!]

Research Questions and Answers

Q: What is the Value of Lost Load (VoLL) borne by Nepali households during the load-shedding crisis?

A1: About as much as the cost of grid electricity service (0.045 to 0.135 \$/kWh) . A lot for Nepal but little for developed economies!

A2: Large differences between VoLL for load shedding vs.

unscheduled outages. Again, lots of heterogeneity [TBC!]

Research Questions and Answers

Q: Does it pay off to improve residential power supply?

A1: <u>Not really</u>, as our VoLL estimates are lower than marginal cost of improving reliability of power supply

A2: <u>Yes it does</u>, if we think beyond direct benefits to households

Presentation Outline

- 1. Prelude: Research Questions (and Answers)
- 2. Setting the Playground: Nepal Load-Shedding Crisis
- 3. Attacking the Problem: Research Design and Data
- 4. Reconciliation: Key Results

Unreliable Power Supply is a Major Problem in South Asia



Average power outages in firms in a typical month, 2006-2018. Source: WDI, 2018

Nepal is one of the poorest countries in the world in terms of electricity consumption ...



Source: World Bank (2014), WDI

... but the demand has been growing, strongly outpacing supply

...



Source: Nepal Electricity Authority (2018)

... leading to increasingly severe power outages since 2008 ...



Source: Nepal Electricity Authority

... until NEA has eliminated load shedding in 2017

- Shifting parts of load from industrial to residential customers
- Improved management of supply
- Loss reduction initiatives
- New generation capacity
- Increased imports from India
 - facilitated by completion of high capacity transmission interconnections
- Consumer awareness and demand side management
- Unscheduled outages still a problem!

Presentation Outline

- 1. Prelude: Research Questions (and Answers)
- 2. Setting the Playground: Nepal Load-Shedding Crisis

3. Attacking the Problem: Research Design and Data

4. Reconciliation: Key Results

Contingent Valuation Design

- Key idea: survey households after load-shedding eliminated
- "Do still experience power outages at the time of the survey?" ->
- "Did you experience power outages one year before?" ->
- "Would you willing to pay a specified amount of money on top of their monthly bill to avoid going back to the situation of the year before?" ->
- Randomly chosen amount out of a list of possible values
 - (100, 200, 300, 400 and 500 NR) ->
 - Followed by "best" estimate

- The WBG MTF Survey Data for 2017 (4,047 grid-connected households)
 - Reported outages in a "typical" and "worst" month
 - Electricity consumption
 - Whether or not household use power back-up (inverter / solar system)
 - Other households' characteristics
- Zonal load-shedding schedules reported by NEA
- Records of power outages at substation-level for 2016-2017

Distribution of monthly electricity consumption



Scheduled Outages in 2016



Unscheduled outages (reported by the respondents)

- In the typical month:
 - average 40 outages (median: 22.5)
 - average 30.82 hours without electricity (median: 13.5)
- In the worst month:
 - Average 76.7 outages (median 40.5)
 - Average 92.38 hours without electricity (median 63)
- People were still experiencing outages (at the time of the survey)
 - No electricity on average 2.99 hours per outage-day (median 1.5)

Distribution of Number of Outages "this month" but "a year ago"



Average 20 (median 22)

37% of the households reported 30 or more outages (i.e., there were outages every day)

Strong Correlation of Respondents' Recall and Substation level Data



"How much would you pay on top of your monthly bill to avoid the outages this month a year ago?"

- 2723 households report outages this month last year
- Reported WTP:
 - average 123.16 NR (median: 100NR)
- 26% report zero WTP
 - Low Income (+)
 - Poorly educated (+)
 - Use of disposable batteries (-)
- WTP per outage-day: 10.96 NR

Quantitative Analysis of Value of Lost Load (VoLL)

- "Explicit" VoLL = WTP / Total Number of Outages [scheduled + unscheduled]
- Regression 1:

$$WTP \ per \ outageday_i = \theta_1 \cdot kWh_{lost_{unsch_i}} + \theta_2 \cdot kWh_{lost_{sched_i}} + u_i,$$

- θ_1 and θ_2 are the VoLL per unscheduled kWh loss and unscheduled kWh lost
- Regression 2:

$$WTP_i = \alpha_i \cdot outageday_i + X'\beta + u_i$$

- Reported outages instrumented by observed substation outages to address recall bias.
- VoLL = α_i / kWh_{lost_i}

Presentation Outline

- 1. Prelude: Research Questions (and Answers)
- 2. Setting the Playground: Nepal Load-Shedding Crisis
- 3. Attacking the Problem: Research Design and Data
- 4. Reconciliation: Key Results

Best estimate of VoLL ranges between 5-15NR/kWh



Unscheduled outages matter more

	N=2251			
	coeff	t stat	coeff	t stat
kWh_lost_unscheduled	14.65	13.90	13.27	12.83
kWh_lost_scheduled	8.52	12.94	3.75	4.42
Equipment Controls	No		Yes	

Note. Dependent variable: WTP per outage day

Dependent Var: WTP	OLS	IV
Constant	64.84*** (10.38)	-52.12 (45.08)
# of Outage days	0.428 (0.286)	6.847*** (2.413)
Monthly expenditures	0.000182*** (6.19e-05)	0.000232*** (6.54e-05)
Kathmandu valley (1 = Yes)	-9.937 (11.99)	(17.90) 21.87
Recharg_battery and backup for appliances	-47.29*** (9.129)	-76.29*** (14.53)
Disposable batteries	-14.66 (9.849)	-23.97** (10.98)
Solar system	-25.91 (23.29)	<u>-40.31</u> (28.26)
Kerosene lamp	- 29 .42*** (9.723)	-64.20*** (16.27)
Subsidies	-1.777 (6.377)	2.460 (7.082)
Reliable 1	87.90*** (6.199)	84.28*** (7.008)
Robust standard errors and t statistics	Yes	Yes



Residential VoLL estimate (0.045 to 0.135 \$/kWh) is LESS than needed to meet wholesale demand at peak times!

Thank you!

Not only the poor experience outages!

